In order to comply with the new Common Core standards, it is imperative teachers, particularly those at the elementary levels, incorporate English/Language Arts (ELA) in their social studies classes. These reading, writing, speaking, and listening foci, through the use of informational texts, necessitate strategies to help students meet these standards. They also help students learn social studies content and gain historical understanding. Teachers can meet these standards through an adapted Jigsaw strategy using primary source materials. We review a modified Jigsaw strategy; we call a “Source-Focused Jigsaw.” An aspect of this type of Jigsaw is its allowance of students to focus on the similarities and differences between multiple documents, which is a specific emphasis of the Common Core Standards. This strategy allows young learners to think like a historian and to understand various sources often contain different information. They also learn multiple sources may be necessary to for decision-making. The authors provide lesson examples of its use with social studies informational texts and ELA.

Keywords: Common Core standards, elementary education, English/Language Arts, jigsaw strategy, social studies, Paul Revere

With the advent of the Common Core standards, it is imperative elementary teachers incorporate English/Language Arts (ELA) in their social studies classes (Calkins, Ehrenworth, & Lehman, 2012.) The Common Core’s attention to reading, writing, speaking, and listening through the use of informational texts, necessitates strategies be implemented to help students meet standards while also learning social studies content and historical thinking (Calkins, Ehrenworth, & Lehman, 2012; National Governor’s Association for Best Practices, 2012). The Jigsaw strategy is a collaborative learning technique that promotes student engagement (Aronson, Blaney, Stephan, Sikes, & Snapp, 1978; Marzano, Pickering, & Pollock, 2001; Ogle, Klemp, & McBride, 2007; Silver, Strong, & Perini, 2007). In this article, we will review this strategy and provide examples of its use with social studies informational texts and English Language Arts.

The Jigsaw strategy emerged in the late 1970’s as an approach to allow students to work in collaborative and heterogeneous teams to “learn content that has been broken into chunks” (Silver et al., 2007, p. 187). In a Jigsaw activity, students identify a home group where they will begin and end the collaborative learning process. In the home group, students learn a specific chunk of content. They then break into heterogeneous groups to serve as experts about the topic they studied in their home groups. Each student expert teaches classmates the chunk of the material for which he or she is responsible. In turn, each learns new material from other experts. The use of reading, writing, and discussion, as students work together to achieve a common goal, helps them better remember the material, thus effectively promoting student achievement (Johnson, Johnson, & Holubec, 1994; Marzano et al., 2001).
Both of us have been classroom teachers and currently prepare future educators in a university setting. While teaching social studies, Scott investigated additional ways to use the Jigsaw approach. Stemming from his research on inquiry based practices, he began using an adapted strategy that allowed students, through the Jigsaw approach, to become experts on one specific source. As a district Social Studies Program Specialist, he was exposed later to the Common Core standards and to the literature on building literacy through social studies. He further developed his modified Jigsaw strategy, calling it a Source-Focused Jigsaw, and presented it to his school districts’ social studies teachers. Similar to the original strategy, the collaborative, Source-Focused Jigsaw teaches students “good research, communication, planning, and collaborative skills” (Roberts, 2012, p.73). An aspect of this type of Jigsaw is that it allows students to focus on the similarities and differences between multiple documents, which is a specific focus of the Common Core Standards. This strategy allows students at an early age to think like a historian by understanding various sources often contain different information. They also learn multiple sources may be needed to obtain information to answer a question. The Common Core Standards, for example, standard CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.1.9 requires first grade students to “identify basic similarities in and differences between two texts on the same topic (e.g., in illustrations, descriptions, or procedures” (National Governors Association for Best Practices, Council of Chief State School Officers, 2012, p.13). In turn, third grade students should “come to discussions prepared, having read or studied material; explicitly draw on that preparation and other information known about the topic to explore ideas under discussion” (National Governors Association for Best Practices, Council of Chief State School Officers, 2012, p.24). Fifth grade students, additionally, should be able to “conduct short research projects that use several sources to build knowledge though investigation of different aspects of a topic” (National Governor’s Association for Best Practices, 2012, p. 20)

**Literacy and Interdisciplinary Benefits**

In addition to encouraging cooperative learning and social studies development as well as improving listening, communication, and problem-solving skills, the Source-Focused Jigsaw technique helps to build reading and listening comprehension. This strategy generates interdisciplinary understanding that is purposeful as well as deliberatively and productively integrative. Integration is structured so students develop knowledge and modes of thinking from two or more subject groups to create a new understanding. The authentic integration of reading, writing, listening, and speaking that this strategy utilizes supports the Common Core’s call for work across multiple disciplines for comprehensive college and career readiness. As Boix-Mansilla (2010) explains:

According to the Standards set requirements are not only for English Language Arts (ELA) but also for literacy in history/social studies, science, and technical subjects. Just as students must learn to read, write, speak, listen, and use language effectively in a variety of content areas, so too must the Standards specify the literacy skills and understandings required for college and career readiness in multiple disciplines… In short, students who meet the Standards develop the skills in reading, writing, speaking, and listening that are the foundation for any creative and purposeful expression in language. (p. 3)

As colleagues who prepare future teachers, we discussed the merits of this strategy and developed a sample lesson plan for using the Source-Focused Jigsaw. Scott provided the social studies perspective and Betsy contributed her elementary reading and literacy expertise. The
following article provides ideas on using this reconfigured Jigsaw strategy in the Kindergarten-12 social studies classrooms when studying a historic figure (e.g., Paul Revere). The lesson plan is written in a step-by-step format to assist educators in developing this type of activity on their own. The following are included to guide educators: a generic reproducible Source-focused Jigsaw chart (see Figure 1), and a sample chart using sources on Paul Revere (see Figure 2). A list of specific sources on Paul Revere (see Appendix) are included as well.

**Step 1: Select a Topic**
When selecting a topic to conduct a Source-Focused Jigsaw lesson, choose a standard that possesses with many resources from which to choose. Keep in mind all of your students will be examining the same person or event and analyzing different sources regarding the topic. In the case of this lesson, we chose Paul Revere as he is a topic of study the elementary standards of many states. In Georgia, for example, Revere is taught in both the 3rd and 4th grades. In the third grade standards, Revere is 1 of 9 individuals who are studied to highlight certain character traits, while in the fourth grade standards; he is listed as Revolutionary War hero and a leader in the Sons of Liberty (Georgia Department of Education, 2013).

**Step 2: Selecting Sources**
Locating a variety of sources is critical in developing a Source-Focused Jigsaw. The primary goal is for students to become specialists about one source in order to contribute to the discussion about a historical figure or event. The study of Paul Revere yields a wide variety of sources that can be used in this activity (see Appendix). These sources include non-fiction texts (e.g., textbook, multiple level readers), fictional accounts (e.g., excerpts from Longfellow’s (1996) poem “The Midnight Ride of Paul Revere,” excerpts from the book *Johnny Tremain* (2011), movies and TV shows (e.g., *Johnny Tremain* (2005), School House Rock: Shot Heard Round the World (1975), Liberty Kids: Midnight Ride (2002)), and primary source documents and images (e.g., Copley’s portrait Paul Revere (c. 1768-1770), Revere’s Boston Massacre Engraving (1770)). When the Source-Focused Jigsaw approach was implemented in Scott’s former district, some teachers located several sources and allowed their students to choose the ones that they wanted to analyze. Other teachers gave each group three different sources. No matter what sources chosen, the teacher should select a different one for each group member.

**Step 3: Creating Groups**
Several approaches can be taken when dividing students into Jigsaw teams. Unlike the traditional Jigsaw, where students work together to become experts on one topic then present their information to different groups, the Source-Focused Jigsaw activity removes the expert group step. Some teachers prefer to allow higher level students to work in the same groups to analyze a set of more complex sources, while allowing their middle level and lower level students to work together to examine easier sources. We contend this activity offers teachers the opportunity to allow students at varying levels to work together to achieve a common goal. Since the desired result is that each team completes a graphic organizer and concluding activity, each child, regardless of the chosen source, will be a contributing member. Some of the lower leveled sources, i.e. images, may provide students more information about the topic than complex informational texts.

**Step 4: Analyzing the Sources**
Historical analysis of a variety of sources (text, images, film) in an inquiry based format resembling this lesson, is an important element the development of students’ understanding of history and critical thinking (e.g., Brophy, Alleman, & Knighton, 2009; Levstik & Baron, 2011;
Monte-Sano, 2011; Ogle, Klemp, & McBride, 2007; Stanford University, n.d.;). As Chauncey Monte-Sano (2011) explains, “The very nature of history is interpretive; as a consequence, there are multiple accounts of historical event or issue written by people in real situations with particular interests” (p. 212-213). She also suggests students should examine multiple sources as “the sole focus on the main idea of a single text in history makes understanding the past virtually impossible” (Monte-Sano, 2011, p. 212-213). In turn, the teachers who use the process of historical thinking in their classes can “prepare students for constructive participation in a pluralistic democratic society” (Bickford, 2013, p. 61).

The Common Core standards, and eventual Partnership for Assessment of Readiness for College and Careers (PARCC) and Smarter Balance assessments, will make it critical for students to learn how to analyze sources individually. In this step, we recommend students analyze their own sources and fill in their respective portions of the graphic organizer before collaborating with their groups (see Figures 1 and 2). It should be noted, however, “…history specific instructional procedures and relevant historical content are needed for students to interpret historical documents and construct historical understanding” (Bickford, 2013, p. 61).

For this lesson, we provided a generic graphic organizer to aid students in their analysis of sources (see Figures 1 and 2). In our organizer, students were responsible for analyzing their specific document for the several elements of information about Paul Revere. These included: birth date, death date, interesting facts, family life, and achievements. Students also indicated the type of sources analyzed (i.e., primary or secondary). While these are rather superficial pieces of information for students to find in the documents, the point of the Source-Focused Jigsaw is to help elementary level students compare multiple sources and understand how these sources may support or contradict one another.

Source | DO | DO | Interesting Facts | Family Life | Jobs | Achievements | Type of Source
---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---
O | B | D | O | Source for lower level reader (e.g., a biography written at a lower grade level, movies, image)

Source for middle level reader (Textbook, images, fictional works,
In Figure 2, the School House Rock video “Shot Heard ‘Round the World” (1975) only provides students with information about the march and only one of Revere’s achievements (i.e., offering a warning about the British troops). The website on Copley’s (c. 1768-1770) Paul Revere painting, contrarily, provides students with information that will help students fill in 6 of the 7 columns. Students may be frustrated that none of the sources offer information for all columns. This activity, however, provides students with an example that even multiple sources may not offer all of the information a historian is looking for when analyzing sources.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>DOB</th>
<th>DOO</th>
<th>Interesting Facts</th>
<th>Family Life</th>
<th>Jobs</th>
<th>Achievements</th>
<th>Type of Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Movie: “Shot Heard ‘Round the World”</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>P.R. Told Americans about the British March.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>Helped warned about the British.</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copley: <em>Paul Revere</em> (BFMA Website)</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Painting was made around 1768 Painting was placed in an attic and not displayed</td>
<td>Daughter Great-Grandsons</td>
<td>Silver-smith</td>
<td>Accomplished Silversmith Completed “Sons of Liberty Bowl”</td>
<td>Primary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Along with the graphic organizer provided in this lesson (see Figures 1 and 2), there is a plethora of resources to assist educators in teaching their students the process of analyzing the various sources used for this type of jigsaw (e.g., Bickford, 2013; Brown, 2013; Burgar & Roberts, 2014; Callahan, 2013; Damico & Baildon, 2011; Marcus & Stoddard, 2007; Marinak & Gambrell; Monte-Sano, 2011; Ogle, Klemp, & McBride, 2007). For analyzing textbooks and multilevel readers, Donna Ogle, Ron Klemp and Bill McBride (2007) offer several strategies including preview maps, three column notes, and Frayer models (See pp. 89-126 within their work). Barbra Marinak and Linda Gambrell offer teachers several guiding questions to help their students read these texts. To help elementary level students analyze fiction or children’s literature from a social studies perspective, teachers can review the works by Ann Ackerman, Patricia Howson, and Betty Mulrey (2013) and John Bickford (2013). Teachers are provided two graphic organizers to help students review literature in the Ackerman et al. study, while Bickford offered teachers advice for choosing and working with these sources to promote historical understanding. Finally, for information to help students analyze film and images, Jere Brophy, Janet Alleman, and Barbra Knighton (2009); Cory Callahan, (2013), and Alan Marcus and Jeremy Stoddard (2007) all offer innovative approaches to help students use these visual tools in inquiry focused lessons. Due to the large number of different sources used in the source based jigsaw, we recommend teachers spend some time working with their students on approaches for analyzing each of these types of sources before conducting a source based jigsaw.

**Step 5: Concluding Activity**

Once students transition to working in groups, each member should discuss their source and provide their teammates the information they learned from it. After all group members present their sources, each member should examine the sources together ensure that each was analyzed correctly and thoroughly. Next, students should fill in or add information to each section of the graphic organizer chart. Once the chart is finished, teachers can conduct a whole group discussion and allow individual students to supply information for each section of the chart. The information can be displayed on a Smart Board™ to give each student in the class access to all source information. After students have the charts completed, the teacher should ask students higher order level questions that relate to historical analysis and the Common Core Standards to culminate the lesson such as:

---

**Figure 2. The Source Focused Jigsaw Graphic Organizer-Paul Revere’s Midnight Ride. Note:** X=No Information in Source

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Information</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Longfellow:</strong> <em>Paul Revere’s Ride</em></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ride happened on April 18, 75</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warned Lexington and Concord</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Helped warn about the British.</strong></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Helped Americans win battle.</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Secondary</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Why do you think the sources had different information?
• What do you think historians do when they can’t find all of the information they are looking for?
• Why do you think it is important to use several source when studying an individual or event?
• Which type of source do you think offers the best information? Explain your answer using evidence.

Modifications
As we stress to our future teachers, good educators take lesson ideas and make them their own; this particular lesson is no exception. Teachers should take this lesson and modify it to meet the needs of their students and their state standards. For example, English as a second language and Special Education teachers can use a Source Focused Jigsaw, but provide more visual sources for students to examine. A teacher of gifted and talented students may choose to use only printed excerpts from informational text and literature for the analysis. This activity provides multiple learning entry points and authentic differentiation options.

There are several ways teachers can adapt the structure of the processes. One approach is to use the traditional Jigsaw structure and allow students to meet together to discuss one source as a group, in order to become experts, before moving to heterogeneous groups to teach their peers about their source. Another modification to the structure of the process is to show a movie clip to the class and work through a portion of the graphic organizer chart together. After showing the movie clip, students can work with a partner to analyze additional sources.

There are also many different options to consider as a concluding activity. To bring more writing to the assignment, students can use the completed graphic organizer to write an essay about what they learned and cite their sources to support their ideas. Students might debate which sources they think are the best in providing information about the historic figures and events, once again, using evidence from their chart to support their opinions. Finally, teachers could use students’ newly learned knowledge about the figure or event to write scripts for technology based projects using story telling Web 2.0 sites such as Voki, Blabberize, and VoiceThread.

Conclusion
Research indicates collaboration and discussion are key components in student development of historical understanding. The Jigsaw strategy is found to be highly effective (Aronson et al., 1978; Marzano, Pickering, & Pollock, 2001; Ogle, Klemp, & McBride, 2007; Silver, Strong, & Perini, 2007). In the age of the Common Core Standards and the subsequent assessments, it is crucial for students to be able to synthesize multiple sources on a topic to formulate well-developed responses to document based questions. These responses must be supported by evidence.

The Source-Focused Jigsaw activity, described in this article, provides teachers with one approach to prepare their students for the principles of the Common Core. It further enables the promotion of historical thinking. Offering students a structure to analyze different documents about the same person or event, as both an individual and as part of a Jigsaw team, will give them a better understanding of document based analysis through collaboration and interaction. Using the Source-Focused Jigsaw approach for analyzing documents will help students put the
sources together as they develop a deeper understanding of social studies content and implement their understandings of English/Language Arts.

References
Brown, E.S. (2013). Reading closely and discussing the “I Have a Dream” speech. *Social Studies and the Young Learner, 26*(2), 5-8.


**Web-based References**


**Author Bios**

**Scott L. Roberts** is an Assistant Professor of Elementary Social Studies Education at Central Michigan University and a former Social Studies Program Specialist for Gwinnett County Public Schools in Suwanee, Georgia. His research interests include state history, textbook analysis, instructional technology, building literacy through social studies, and teacher education. Email: rober4s@cmich.edu

**Betsy VanDeusen-MacLeod** is an Associate Professor at Central Michigan University and teaches both undergraduate and graduate literacy courses in the Teacher Education and Professional Development department. She has worked for over 20 years in K-12 public
Education in Michigan as a classroom teacher, reading specialist, professional developer, and a statewide grant coordinator. Email: vande4ea@cmich.edu
Appendix

Sources on Paul Revere

Books

Media
Liberty Kids (2002): *Midnight Ride* can be found on YouTube, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GmZKyH8qqOg
The Ride: Paul Revere Short Educational Film Piece can be found on YouTube,http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Q1El-guPeEo
The Story of Paul Revere can be found on PBSkids.org, http://pbskids.org/go/video/?category=FETCH!%20with%20Ruff%20Ruffman&pid=oIRNN9es_t_qj18ULv1TT_bMUuHJJsuT

Primary Source Documents
The Paul Revere House contains many primary sources and can be found on the Paul Revere Memorial Association’s website, http://www.paulreverehouse.org/.
Revere, Paul (1770). *The Bloody Massacre perpetrated on King Street*. This engraving along with an explanation about it can be found on the Boston Massacre Historical Society’s website at http://www.bostonmassacre.net/gravure.htm.
Revere, Paul (1768). Landing of British Troops at Boston, This engraving provides students with a source showing Revere’s artistic skills. It can be found on the Boston Massacre Historical Society’s website at http://www.bostonmassacre.net/gravure-british-troops.htm.